



**City of Saugatuck
Historic District Commission**

Meeting Minutes May 4, 2023, 6:00 PM

Saugatuck City Hall
102 Butler Street

Call to Order/Roll Call: Chair Straker called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

Present: Chairman Straker, Vice-Chairman Leo, Commission members: Cannarsa, Donahue, Lewis, Panozzo & Paterson.

Absent: None.

Others Present: Director of Planning, Zoning and Project Management Cummins & Deputy Clerk/DPW Admin. Assistant Williams.

Agenda Changes/Additions/Deletions: None.

Approval of Minutes for March 2, 2023:

Motion by Leo, second by Cannarsa, to approve the March 2, 2023, meeting minutes. Upon voice vote, the motion carried unanimously.

Approval of Special Minutes for March 16, 2023:

Motion by Leo, second by Cannarsa, to approve the March 16, 2023, Special meeting minutes. Upon voice vote, the motion carried unanimously.

Public Comments: None.

Unfinished Business: None.

New Business:

A. 865 Holland – Windows, Doors, Roof, and Siding (Voice Vote)

The applicant proposes an exterior renovation to the existing two-family residence at 865 Holland Street, including replacement windows, doors, roofing, and siding on the main building. The materials are intended to match those on the recently approved and constructed

detached garage.

A motion was made by Lewis, second by Donahue to approve replacement windows, doors, roofing, and siding for the two-family building located at 865 Holland Street in accordance with the plans and details submitted within the application materials. The approval shall be subject to the following conditions: smooth not stamped siding. Upon voice vote, the motion carried 5-2.

Yes: Chair Straker, Commissioners Cannarsa, Donahue, Lewis, Paterson.

No: Vice-Chair Leo, and Commissioner Pannozzo.

Absent: None.

B. 201 Butler – New ATM (Voice Vote)

The applicant requests approval for an outdoor Huntington ATM machine in front of the front windows of the building located at 201 Butler. The property is located in the City Center C-1 zoning district within the Historic District. A commercial building exists on the site.

A motion was made by Leo, second by Donahue, to deny the application to put an ATM in front of 201 Butler Street. Upon voice vote, motion carried unanimously.

C. 149 Griffith – Windows, Deck, Fence, Siding, Doors, Remove Chimney - (Voice Vote)

The applicant proposes a comprehensive exterior renovation to the existing building at 149 Griffith Street, including a replacement deck, steps, and fence to the rear of the building; removal of overgrowth; repainting the building; replacement of siding; restoration of six windows; repairs to the roof; new front windows and doors; front deck replacement; repair of deck rail, trim, and spindles; and removal of the brick chimney.

A motion was made by Cannarsa, second by Leo to approve the comprehensive renovation plans for 149 Griffith in accordance with the plans and details submitted with the application materials. In addition, the windows on the Mason Street elevation are to remain in their footprint and interior blackout can occur on the one window in question. For the requested window modification, the window frame and window will stay the same with the lower sash being a false sash and appear the same from the outside. Upon roll call vote, motion carried unanimously.

D. 660 Lake – Windows, Door, Remove Awnings (Voice Vote)

The applicant proposes exterior renovations to the existing dwelling at 660 Lake Street, including repainting the building; replacement of awnings, replacement of windows, and replacement of a door.

Chair Straker, Cannarsa and Paterson disclosed that they live in the Windjammer Condominiums. Chair Straker and Cannarsa are owners of 333. Chair Straker and Paterson are on the board.

Director Cummins explained that the rule of necessity applies as it did during a previous meeting. He explained the quorum necessary for the official action would not be met due to the conflict of interest. He advised each member should declare that conflict on the record and indicate they don't have any bias and that they're going to fairly decide this request on its merits.

Chair Straker, Cannarsa and Paterson each declared the conflict, that they wouldn't act with bias and would decide the case based on the standards.

A motion was made by Straker, second by Donahue to approve the application with the following modifications:

- *The brick and stone masonry components not be painted and left in natural state.*
- *All windows to remain original except for the jalousie windows on the side and rear of the structure.*
- *The six over six double hung window will be replaced with a two over two window to match the other windows and it will be blacked out to be developed on the other side.*
- *Awnings can provisionally be removed, but what goes in their place needs to come back to the Commission and be reviewed with an additional application.*
- *Anything related to the garage needs to come back with an additional application.*
- *Doors on the front and back to be as submitted, single view French style doors, per the specification sheet.*
- *All trim to be either wood or if synthetic, be non-stamped.*

Upon voice vote, motion carried unanimously.

E. Social District Signage (Voice Vote)

The City of Saugatuck established a Social District in February of 2021. Qualified licensees whose licensed premises are contiguous to the commons area within the Social District, and that have been approved for and issued a Social District Permit, may sell alcoholic liquor (beer, wine, mixed spirit drink, spirits, or mixed drinks) on their licensed premises to customers who may then consume the alcoholic liquor within the commons area of the Social District. State law requires the social district to be “clearly designated and clearly marked”. In past years, the City has utilized a combination of sidewalk decals, metal signage, and yard signage to mark the boundaries. Over time many of the yard signs have disappeared. Staff is recommending more permanent signage be used to mark the social district boundaries.

Motion by Lewis, second by Cannarsa to approve sign location with decal stickers. Upon voice vote, motion carried 6-1.

Yes: Chair Straker, Vice-Chair Leo, Commissioners Cannarsa, Donahue, Lewis, Paterson.

No: Pannozzo

Absent: None.

D. Rules of Procedure Amendments (Voice Vote)

The Historic District Commission's current Rules of Procedure allow an applicant to submit an application up to a week prior to a regularly scheduled Historic District Commission meeting. This doesn't provide enough time for staff and professional consultants to review the application, prepare a report, and submit a meeting packet to the Historic District Commission for sufficient time to review. Staff and our planning consultant met with the Historic District Chair to discuss a more reasonable timeline. We are recommending that the Historic District Commission amend its Rules of Procedure to change the submission deadline to Monday at noon ten days prior to a regularly scheduled meeting. Meeting packets would then be sent out the following Monday.

The current meeting date and time of the Commission doesn't currently align with the Rules of Procedure. It is recommended that the Rules of Procedure be updated to reflect your current meeting date and time.

Motion by Leo, second by Panozzo, to accept the rules and procedure amendments as written second. Upon voice vote, motion carried unanimously.

Administrative Approvals & Updates:

Director of Planning, Zoning and Project Management Cummins gave an update regarding administrative approval for the following:

- A. 222 Butler – Sign
- B. 233 Butler – Roof
- C. 547 Butler – Roof
- D. 127 Hoffman – New Board to Support Awning
- E. 428 Butler – Sign
- F. 329-339 Culver – New Roof
- G. Various – Temporary Rain Barrels

Communication: None.

Public Comment: None.

Commission Comments:

Commissioner Paterson: Asked the Commission if they have seen the lattice work that El Burrito Feliz recently put up. He said that it is Black lattice, looks like it's about maybe five, six feet tall. He thinks that it looks terrible and mentioned that the Commission just agonized over the application for the ATM at 201 Butler. He has seen the disconnect there and the streetscape of that is not acceptable. He asked if that is something that the Zoning Administrator Cummins could call them on.

Chair Straker: Wanted to mention that in relation to the meeting that the

Commission had that talked about the procedures, they also talked with their consultant and gave him kudos on the write ups. They did talk about which they hit on tonight, the notion regarding modern architecture. In one of their last meetings, there was a comment in the recommendations about this is making it up, it's modern, and it doesn't feel compatible. They had good dialogue around what modern is today and the fact that modern is okay. It is about the scale and materiality and streetscape compatibility. They use the modern house at the end of Lake Street across from Hotel Saugatuck, the agony that they went through to make sure that it was cited properly, and it had the right relationship and the right materiality. That is the most important thing in those conversations. He said that it's a dangerous thing in Historic Districts, that people think that if they come in and make something look like it's 1896 approved, but that it is actually the opposite. He stated that they just had that dialogue and thinks that he is good in the way that he prepares these reports and that he is appreciative of the push and pull of all of that.

Adjourn:

Motion by Straker, second by Donahue to adjourn. Upon voice vote, motion carried unanimously. Chair Straker adjourned the meeting adjourned at 7:49 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted by
Sara Williams,

Deputy Clerk